

Ref.: CL/4447

Subject: Draft text of the revised 1974 Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms

Madam/Sir,

At the 41st session of the UNESCO General Conference in November 2021, Member States decided to revise the 1974 Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms.

After two years of work, the revision process is now entering its final phase, and I would like to thank all Member States that have mobilized technical and legal experts to take part in this endeavour. The two sessions of the Intergovernmental Special Committee meeting, which took place from 30 May to 2 June and from 10 to 12 July 2023 at UNESCO Headquarters in Paris, were indeed able to reach a consensus on a draft text of the revised Recommendation.

It is this draft text that I am pleased to send to you, with a view to the adoption of the revised Recommendation at the 42nd session of UNESCO's General Conference in November 2023. You will also find attached the Rapporteur's oral report on the two sessions of the Intergovernmental Special Committee meeting.

The Secretariat of the Recommendation revision process remains at your disposal for any further information at the following email address: <u>1974recommendation@unesco.org</u>.

Please accept, Madam/Sir, the assurances of my highest consideration.

Audrey Azoulay Director-General

Encl.: 2

- 1. Draft text of the revised 1974 Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
- 2. Oral report of the Rapporteur concerning the two sessions of the Intergovernmental Special Committee meeting
- cc: Permanent Delegations to UNESCO National Commissions for UNESCO

7, place de Fontenoy 75352 Paris 07 SP, France Tél. : +33 (0)1 45 68 10 00 Fax : +33 (0)1 45 68 55 55

To Ministers responsible for relations with UNESCO

www.unesco.org

REVISED RECOMMENDATION CONCERNING EDUCATION FOR INTERNATIONAL UNDERSTANDING, CO-OPERATION AND PEACE AND EDUCATION RELATING TO HUMAN RIGHTS AND FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOMS

New title adopted at the intergovernmental meeting:

Recommendation on Education for Peace and Human Rights, International Understanding, Cooperation, Fundamental Freedoms, Global Citizenship and Sustainable Development

In accordance with the UNESCO Constitution and the Rules of Procedure concerning Recommendations to Member States and international conventions covered by the terms of Article IV, paragraph 4, of the Constitution, the draft text of the revised Recommendation concerning education for international understanding, co-operation and peace and education relating to human rights and fundamental freedoms, and the related preliminary report, were sent to UNESCO Member States through the circular letter CL/4401 (September 2022) for their written comments and observations. On the basis of their comments, a second draft of the text was prepared. In circular letter CL/4433 (April 2023), the second draft together with the Definitive Report were submitted to Member States. The Special Committee meeting of experts designated by Member States took place from 30 May to 2 June 2023, as per the circular letter CL/4442 (June 2023).

The text herein was adopted at the intergovernmental meeting.

Recommendation on Education for Peace and Human Rights, International Understanding, Cooperation, Fundamental Freedoms, Global Citizenship and Sustainable Development

PREAMBLE

The General Conference of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), meeting in Paris from (...),

Acknowledging the responsibility of States to respect, protect, and promote the right of all persons to education, and ensure that it is of quality and inclusive, accessible and equitable for everyone considering that education contributes to the realization of all other rights,

Mindful of the responsibility incumbent on States to achieve through education the aims set forth in the Charter of the United Nations, the Constitution of UNESCO, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, and all other relevant international human rights instruments, such as the Convention on the Status of Refugees, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, the Convention on the Rights of the Child, the Convention against Discrimination in Education, the Geneva Conventions of 1949 and their Additional Protocols, the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, the United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training, the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples and the United Nations Declaration on the Rights and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms,

Recognizing that peace not only requires the absence of war or armed conflicts but also requires an inclusive, democratic and participatory process in which human security, respect for State sovereignty and territorial integrity, dialogue and solidarity are encouraged, internal and international conflicts are resolved through mutual understanding and cooperation, sustainable development in all its dimensions is achieved, universal access to lifelong and life-wide education, including in emergency and conflict situations is provided, poverty in all its forms and dimensions including extreme poverty is eradicated, all human rights and fundamental freedoms of all persons without exception are upheld and active global citizenship is promoted,

Reaffirming the important link between education and the achievement of peace, human rights and fundamental freedoms, international understanding, cooperation, democracy, the rule of law, global citizenship and sustainable development,

Recalling each State's responsibility to promote and ensure human rights education as stated in the United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training and in the United Nations Declaration on the Right to Peace,

Noting the global rise in disinformation, misinformation, hate speech and online harassment, which threatens the achievement of sustainable development, democracy and peace, and further recognizing that it is necessary to strengthen efforts to enhance people's media and information literacy globally,

Also recognizing the important role of education in empowering individuals, communities and societies to address global challenges and to take transformative action for ensuring sustainable development and in implementing the United Nations 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, which acknowledges "that there can be no sustainable development without peace and no peace without sustainable development" and commits States "to combat inequalities within and among countries; to build peaceful, just and inclusive societies; to protect human rights and promote gender equality and the empowerment of youth and all women and girls; and to ensure the lasting protection of the planet and its natural resources", as well as the Education 2030: Incheon Declaration and Framework for Action for the Implementation of Sustainable Development Goal 4, and Article 6 on

Education of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) and the Paris Agreement adopted under the UNFCCC, that calls on countries to "enhance climate change education [and] training" and the Berlin Declaration on Education for Sustainable Development, which underlines the role of education for sustainable development as an enabler for the achievement of all Sustainable Development Goals and states that "ESD must be based on and promote respect for nature, as well as human rights, democracy, the rule of law, non-discrimination, equity and gender equality",

Also reaffirming States' commitment to notably "ensure that all learners acquire knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including, among others, through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development",

Further reaffirming the commitments of the "Women, Peace, and Security" Agenda and related UN Security Council resolutions in supporting the participation of women and girls in peace processes, increasing gender expertise, and recognizing the unique, specific impact of conflict on women and girls' education,

Reaffirming, in line with the Youth, Peace and Security Agenda, the important role youth can play in the prevention and resolution of conflicts and as a key aspect of the sustainability, inclusiveness and success of peacekeeping and peacebuilding efforts,

Bearing in mind the call of UNESCO's Constitution for intellectual and moral solidarity and considering the responsibility incumbent on UNESCO to encourage and support Member States in any activity designed to ensure the education of all persons for the advancement of peace in order to further universal respect for justice, non-discrimination, social development, international cooperation, the rule of law, human rights and fundamental freedoms,

Also reaffirming that education is a human right and a lifelong process and that it "shall be directed to the full development of the human personality and to the strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms. It shall promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations, racial or religious groups, and shall further the activities of the United Nations for the maintenance of peace" as stated in Article 26 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights,

Observing that the free flow of information, access to information and knowledge, freedom of expression and opinion, academic and scientific freedom, professional responsibility, and institutional autonomy are central to learning and teaching as well as important in achieving international understanding, cooperation, peace, human rights, fundamental freedoms, democracy, global citizenship, and sustainable development,

Further recognizing that States should create caring and inclusive learning conditions, free from all forms of violence, for all actors and communities, by engaging all relevant stakeholders within society in education, including local and regional authorities, educational institutions, civil society organizations, the private sector, independent national human rights institutions, the media, as well as all children, young people and adults, and their family members in meaningful and effective participation,

Further reaffirming that education should nurture respect for cultural diversity as an intrinsic characteristic of societies as well as be directed to promoting international understanding and global citizenship, tolerance, pluralism, respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms, solidarity among all nations and peoples, and to furthering multilateralism and the principles and purposes of the Charter of the United Nations and international law,

Also noting that despite significant progress achieved, countless people have been denied a life of dignity and opportunity, notably, because they are deprived of the enabling right to education,

Further noting that environmental degradation, climate change, biodiversity loss, and desertification hamper the enjoyment of a clean, healthy and sustainable environment, and threaten the ability of present and future generations to effectively enjoy all human rights and fundamental freedoms, to live their lives in peace and dignity and have access to opportunities, including learning opportunities, and an environment that ensures well-being,

Conscious of the urgency to take action towards closing the gaps that separate proclaimed ideals from the implementation of legal and political commitments and from the realization of positive and concrete change,

Persuaded that to shape peaceful, just, equal, equitable, supportive, inclusive, democratic, healthy and sustainable societies, educational settings should be a model for inclusion, justice, caring, relevance, adaptation, and expanded for the benefit of all,

Recognizing the importance of safeguarding the right to education for all, particularly for children and learners affected by armed conflict, occupation, disasters and other crises, including for refugees, internally displaced and other groups and populations in vulnerable situations, and in this regard the need to ensure continuity of quality education and protect educational institutions and civilian personnel connected to them from attacks and threats of attacks, and affirming the need to ensure the implementation of measures in line with relevant United Nations Security Council resolutions, including Resolution 2601 (2021), taking note of efforts aimed at facilitating the continuation of education in armed conflict, including the efforts of Member States that have endorsed the Safe Schools Declaration,

Taking note of international instruments – adopted by UNESCO and other United Nations entities – and relevant intergovernmental initiatives set out in the appendix,

Having decided at its 41st session, in 41 C/Resolution 17, and bearing in mind the expanding landscape of norms, that the 1974 Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms needed to be revised to take into account new developments and challenges in the global and educational landscape with a view to firmly embedding the role of education in fostering peace, international understanding, cooperation, human rights and fundamental freedoms, global citizenship and sustainable development,

- 1. **Adopts** thisday of November, the present Recommendation on Education for Peace and Human Rights, International Understanding, Cooperation, Fundamental Freedoms, Global Citizenship and Sustainable Development, which supersedes the 1974 Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms;
- 2. **Suggests** that this Recommendation can be commonly referred to as the "Recommendation on Education for Peace, Human Rights and Sustainable Development";
- 3. **Recommends** that Member States apply the provisions of this Recommendation by taking appropriate steps, including whatever legislative or other measures may be required, in conformity with the constitutional practice and governing structures of each State, to give effect within their jurisdictions to the principles of the Recommendation;
- 4. **Also recommends** that Member States bring the Recommendation to the attention of those responsible for formal, non-formal and informal education from early childhood care and education, through primary and secondary schools to higher education, technical and vocational education and training, teacher training, adult education, and life-long learning as well as all key stakeholders carrying out educational work among children, young people and adults, and other interested parties;

5. *Further recommends* that Member States report to the General Conference, at such dates and in such manner as shall be determined by it, on the action taken by them in pursuance of this Recommendation.

I. DEFINITIONS

- 1. For the purposes of this Recommendation:
 - (a) "Education" is an inalienable human right. This is a lifelong and society-wide process, through which everyone learns, and develops to their fullest potential, the whole of their personality, sense of dignity, talents and mental and physical abilities, within and for the benefit of local, national, regional and global communities, and ecosystems;
 - (b) "Peace", "international understanding", and "cooperation" are to be considered as an indivisible whole based on the principle of friendly relations between peoples, on cooperation with a wide range of stakeholders and on an understanding that States have different social and political systems, while respecting human rights and fundamental freedoms;
 - (c) "Culture of peace", is understood as defined by the Declaration and Programme of Action on a Culture of Peace (A/RES/53/243);
 - (d) "Human rights" and "fundamental freedoms", are recognized and defined by international human rights instruments, primarily the Charter of the United Nations, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the International Covenants on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, and on Civil and Political Rights and other conventions and treaties on human rights. They derive from the inherent dignity of the human person and are universal, indivisible, inalienable and interrelated;
 - (e) "Human rights education" is understood as defined in the Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training (A/RES/66/137);
 - (f) "Education for sustainable development" "empowers learners to take informed decisions and responsible actions for environmental integrity, economic viability and a just society, for present and future generations, while respecting cultural diversity", as defined in the Education 2030 Framework for Action;
 - (g) "Global citizenship education" is understood as referred to in the Education 2030 Framework for Action¹;
 - (h) "Inclusion" is defined as it appears in the UNESCO Guidelines for Inclusion:
 - (i) "Transformative education" involves co-created teaching and learning that recognizes and valorizes the dignity and diversity of learners in educational settings, eliminates all barriers to their learning and motivates and empowers them to reflect critically, become agents of change and protagonists of their own future, enabling informed decisionmaking and actions at the individual, community, local, national, regional and global levels, including through approaches such as global citizenship education, education for sustainable development and human rights education, among others, that support the building of peaceful, just, inclusive, equal, equitable, healthy and sustainable societies.

II. AIMS

2. The overarching aim of this Recommendation is to provide guidance to Member States in their efforts to infuse into education, by taking a multi-stakeholder approach, the aims and purposes

As defined in footnote 13 of the Education 2030: Incheon Declaration and Framework for Action for the implementation of Sustainable Development Goal 4.

set forth in the Charter of the United Nations, the Constitution of UNESCO, the International Human Rights Charter, and other relevant international human rights instruments.

- 3. This includes ensuring all people, throughout their life, are equipped and empowered with the knowledge, skills, including socio-emotional skills, values, attitudes and behaviours needed for effective participation in democratic decision-making processes, economic empowerment, awareness-raising and individual and collective actions at community, local, national, regional and global levels that advance peace and promote international understanding, cooperation, poverty eradication and tolerance, in order to ensure the full enjoyment of human rights, fundamental freedoms, global citizenship and sustainable development through education.
- 4. This Recommendation also aims to mobilize, guide and support the actions, initiatives and programmes of non-state actors involved in educational activities throughout society for the same purposes.
- 5. Education should emphasize the importance of preventing and addressing war, aggression and all forms of violence and human rights violations, and bring every person and community to understand and assume their responsibilities for maintaining, fostering and demanding peace. Education should also contribute to activities in the fight against racism, xenophobia and all actions and ideologies inciting hatred, all forms of intolerance, discrimination, and violence.
- 6. Specifically, education should be transformative, build a strong foundation of literacy and numeracy and enable the development of knowledge, skills, values, attitudes and behaviours such as:
 - (a) Analytical and critical thinking: the ability to question norms, practices and opinions, critically analyse and understand complex systems and multicultural environments, as well as understand power dynamics and the interconnections between countries, populations and the natural environment and between local, national, regional and global levels;
 - (b) Anticipatory skills: the ability to act as agents of change and the capacity to evaluate and understand emerging and future opportunities and threats and to adapt to new possibilities with a view to promoting a peaceful, just, equal, equitable, inclusive, healthy and sustainable future for all;
 - (c) Respect for diversity: the ability to understand, value and respect the equal dignity and rights of every person, regardless of race, colour, descent, gender, age, language, religion, political opinion, national, ethnic or social origin, economic or social condition of birth, or disability and any other grounds as well as their needs, perspectives and peaceful actions and valuing their diverse knowledge systems and learning activities;
 - (d) Self-awareness: the ability to acknowledge and reflect critically on one's personal values, perceptions and actions, to know, value and be at peace with oneself, understand and manage emotions, feel and show empathy and respect for others and for one's role in the local, national, regional and global community;
 - (e) Sense of connectedness and belonging to a common and diverse humanity and planet Earth: understanding humanity as a global community that shares responsibility for a healthy planet and for respecting the needs and rights of each other, of other living beings and of nature itself;
 - (f) Empowerment, agency and resilience: the motivation, confidence and ability to act and respond effectively, proactively, consciously and responsibly to challenges at local, national, regional and global levels, while being able to cope with risks, conflicts of goals and uncertainties;

- (g) Decision-making skills: the ability to evaluate the impact of actions, and make decisions, using available information from diverse and reliable sources;
- (h) Collaborative skills: the ability to effectively communicate feelings and opinions in a constructive manner and engage in collaborative interactions, participatory planning and shared problem-solving marked by responsible and respectful behaviour;
- Adaptive and creative skills: the capacity to adapt, engage, create, innovate, and thrive in a fast-evolving environment and in diverse and shifting contexts, so that new ideas can be transformed into actions;
- (j) Citizenship skills: the ability to act ethically and responsibly and to fully participate in civic and social life, in a digital era and in a local, national and global context;
- (k) Peaceful conflict resolution and transformation skills: the ability to deal with and contribute to the prevention, mediation and resolution of conflicts in a peaceful, constructive and negotiated manner and end cycles of violence and hostility:
- (I) Media and information literacy, communication and digital skills: the ability to effectively search, access, critically evaluate, ethically produce, use and disseminate information and knowledge through various channels and technologies. It also implies to be resilient, to be able to detect and to combat disinformation and misinformation, hate speech, all forms of violence, including gender-based violence, harmful content and online abuse and exploitation, understanding one's rights and responsibilities on- and off-line and engaging in digital environments in a safe, effective, discerning and respectful way that enhances digital security and protects privacy.

III. SCOPE

- 7. This Recommendation applies a lifelong, equitable and inclusive perspective and, as such, covers educational activities:
 - (a) for all people;
 - (b) delivered in all contexts and in formal, non-formal and informal settings;
 - (c) using different modalities and pedagogies; and
 - (d) at all levels, of all types and provisions, including through multi-stakeholder and other partnerships.

IV. GUIDING PRINCIPLES

- 8. Education oriented towards the aims of this Recommendation should be transformative and of quality, and thus guided by the following principles:
 - (a) Recognize that quality education is a public and common good, which should be accessible to all;
 - (b) Grounded in rights and corresponding obligations, enshrined in international law and international human rights law, including all civil, cultural, economic, political and social rights, and the right to development, and operationally directed to promoting and protecting human rights;
 - (c) Irrespective of race, colour, descent, gender, age, language, religion, political opinion, national, ethnic or social origin, economic or social condition of birth, or disability and any other grounds, ensure non-discrimination, inclusion and equity, in and through education.

as prescribed by international human rights law while empowering learners as rightsholders;

- Promote an ethic of care and solidarity through cultivating reciprocity and compassion with a view to encouraging convivial relations, neighbourliness and a sense of belonging;
- (e) Promote gender equality in and through education. It is key to the realization of the right to education for all and for the empowerment of women and girls;
- (f) Recognize that everyone has the right to education and should be guaranteed equitable access to inclusive and quality education that is respectful of their identity and encourages knowledge of their history, traditions, language and culture, and that of others, without discrimination of any kind. As stated in the UNESCO Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity, the defence of cultural diversity "implies a commitment to human rights and fundamental freedoms [...]. No one may invoke cultural diversity to infringe upon human rights guaranteed by international law, nor to limit their scope";
- (g) Ensure that the safety, health and well-being of all learners, teachers and education personnel are protected and promoted;
- (h) Recognize education and learning as a continuous, lifelong, life-encompassing, holistic, humanistic and transformative process;
- (i) Recognize, appreciate and promote awareness among all education policy-makers, education leaders, teachers and education personnel that all learners, without discrimination, actively create and co-create knowledge;
- (j) Ensure freedom of thought, conscience, belief and religion as well as freedom of expression and opinion, which includes ensuring the right to seek, receive and impart information and ideas, in all forms and all media, while prohibiting any advocacy of hatred on any grounds that constitutes incitement to discrimination or violence, as established in relevant international human rights law;
- (k) Encourage, empower and support the willingness, and build the capacity, of individuals to engage proactively in solving problems at community, local, national, regional and global levels notably through the ethical and responsible use of current and future technologies;
- (I) Enable an international and global perspective in education, underlining the interconnections between the local and the global;
- (m) Promote intercultural and intergenerational dialogue for cooperation and solidarity and reinforce effective communication to help develop friendly relations between and among peoples, societies and countries;
- (n) Raise awareness of the increasing interdependence of individuals, communities, societies, countries, natural resources and ecosystems, and cultivate an ethic of global citizenship and shared responsibility for peace, human rights and sustainable development for the benefit of all, within planetary boundaries.

V. ACTION AREAS

9. The following action areas describe what should be done to advance the aims of this Recommendation, in accordance with the guiding principles previously stated.

V.1. System-wide requirements

Laws, policies and strategies

- 10. Member States and all stakeholders should proactively support education leaders, educational institutions, teachers and education personnel in mainstreaming the above guiding principles in education through a whole-institution and whole-of-society approach. To do so, Member States in cooperation with all stakeholders should:
 - (a) adopt all necessary measures and ensure that educational activities supporting the aims and guiding principles of this Recommendation are granted due attention and resources, notably but not only in emergency and crises-affected situations, where clear inequalities exist in access to and enjoyment of quality education at all stages;
 - (b) with due regard to the complexity of global challenges, create context-specific, science-, research- and evidence-based laws, policies and strategies, which are regularly updated to be in line with the evolving educational needs and scientific advancement and evidence, and which are developed through an informed and participatory decisionmaking process, utilizing the full potential of interdisciplinary, multidisciplinary, transdisciplinary and intersectoral approaches;
 - (c) create policy mechanisms to support flexible and context-relevant pathways of learning (formal and non-formal) that allow learners to engage in the world throughout life as responsible local and global citizens. Such mechanisms can be strengthened through the adoption, recognition, validation and accreditation of qualifications and prior formal or non- formal learning across borders;
 - (d) ensure that legislation, policies and strategies aim to address all biases and inequalities and contribute to the prevention of all forms of discrimination in and through the education system, notably in societies suffering from occupation or armed conflict;
 - (e) strengthen school systems' ability to promote physical and mental health and well-being in order to foster commitments to non-violence and peace, without discrimination. This can be achieved through the provision of school health services, school meals and education for health and well-being of good quality; and
 - (f) create mechanisms and strategies to support means of capacity building and improvement for teaching personnel, in order to improve their professional, pedagogical and didactical development, as well as their ability to lead and participate in research in the field of education.

Governance, accountability and partnerships

- 11. Member States should ensure good governance in education and other social accountability measures including regular monitoring, follow-up and reflective reviews. Practices that bolster accountability and transparency should be put in place.
- 12. Member States should provide all necessary support, including financial, administrative, technical, human and material resources to implement this Recommendation in line with international obligations and commitments.
- 13. Member States should enable educational authorities and institutions, teachers and education personnel to provide educational programmes in line with this Recommendation that are developed through open dialogue, including intergenerational exchange, with all relevant stakeholders.
- 14. Member States should engage in and encourage local, regional, international and intercultural cooperation, dialogue and exchange as a key dimension of transformative education and of the promotion of a culture of peace.

- 15. Member States should carry out capacity-building activities and establish sustainable partnerships in education with other Member States and all relevant actors, including non-governmental organizations, and share good practices while taking into account the differences between institutions.
- 16. While individuals and bodies are free to establish and direct educational institutions, Member States should ensure that these institutions conform to minimum standards as laid down or approved by the State, in compliance with their international commitments and the public responsibility for education.
- 17. Member States and other stakeholders should engage cooperatively in governance, policymaking, monitoring, evaluation and reporting with due respect for each others' responsibilities, roles and mutual accountability.
- 18. Member States should support the provision of and access to information and education, for individual learners, communities, parents, caregivers and families to ensure the health and well-being and the positive physical and mental development of children, young people and families.

Curriculum and pedagogy

- 19. Member States should ensure that educational activities serving the aims of this Recommendation on education for peace and human rights, international understanding, cooperation, fundamental freedoms, global citizenship and sustainable development are coordinated and form a coherent whole within curricula for different levels and types of education, knowledge, disciplines, learning and training.
- 20. Member States should support the development of contextualized curricula, for all subjects and topics, elaborated in an inclusive manner, that connects with the concerns and issues that learners face in their daily lives, as well as with diverse knowledge systems. The objective is to empower learners to apply their knowledge and skills, when responding to these issues in ways that actively support and advance the aims and guiding principles of this Recommendation.
- 21. Education for peace and human rights, international understanding, cooperation, fundamental freedoms, global citizenship and sustainable development should be provided to all learners, teachers, education personnel and educational communities, and contribute to universal values, the prevention of human rights' and fundamental freedoms' violations and abuses, promote a universal culture of peace, as well as enable every person to exercise their own rights and to promote the rights of others and participate democratically in the cultural and social life of their educational institutions, community and public affairs.
- 22. A transformative approach to education should be embedded into curricula and across all areas of study and at all levels of education. This includes adopting holistic, multidisciplinary, interdisciplinary and transdisciplinary approaches to explore the relationships between subject and study areas and their relevance to diverse contexts.
- 23. The practice of physical education and sports and learning through sports should instil in learners of all ages the values of respect, equity, cooperation and team spirit, inclusion and non-discrimination, promote healthy lifestyles and develop cognitive, social, emotional, psycho-motor and behavioural skills conducive to collaboration and mutual understanding.
- 24. The teaching and learning of history, social sciences and related fields should provide learners with the opportunity to build a critical understanding of the complex relationships between past, present and future and of the legacies of violence, exclusion, and all forms of discrimination and their effects. This requires pursuing historical objectivity; promoting multi-perspectivity based on science, research and evidence; fostering critical views of and supporting the struggle against colonialism and neo-colonialism in all their forms and manifestations;

sustaining a duty of memory; rejecting denial and distortion of proven historical events; highlighting the role of women in history and society; and exploring the factors that, over time, can either contribute towards violence and tensions, or foster reconciliation, peace and solidarity between and within countries.

- 25. The teaching of natural science, technology, engineering and mathematics (STEM) should help transcend frontiers and build bridges between communities and knowledge systems. All learners should be equipped with skills to engage with the learning of science and scientific methods as well as the ethics of scientific knowledge and technology in order to help seek sustainable solutions to contemporary challenges in the interests of advancing the aims of this Recommendation. Particular attention should be paid to women and girls to ensure equal access to STE) disciplines and better representation of women in STEM careers.
- 26. Member States should promote an education that, throughout all levels and strands, includes the study of different cultures and their reciprocal influence. Such study should encourage the understanding and valuing of diverse perspectives, ways of life, worldviews, religions, beliefs and philosophies of life and has the potential to reduce conflicts that are based on a lack of understanding. It should, among other things, give due importance to the teaching of languages and the promotion of intercultural competencies in an environment respectful of human rights and fundamental freedoms and helping students to become informed local and global citizens. Culture and arts education advances creative learning and the acquisition of new civic competencies. It provides a better understanding of cultural heritage and strengthens a sense of belonging and social and emotional learning fostering the appreciation of cultural diversity.
- 27. To enhance mutual understanding, solidarity and social cohesion, Member States should valorize, respect and enhance the diversity of knowledge systems, ways of expression, transmission and safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage, inter alia through the recognition of linguistic diversity, the promotion of intercultural dialogue, the development of multilingual skills, the valorization of all languages, notably Indigenous languages and mother tongue languages, and the appreciation of diverse perspectives.
- 28. To release the full potential of education directed towards the aims of this Recommendation, affordable, inclusive, sustainable, non-discriminatory, age-appropriate and context-specific approaches that promote gender equality are needed for all learners. Research-based learning, appropriate pedagogies and innovative approaches including active and collaborative pedagogical approaches should be utilized to integrate the cognitive, social, emotional and behavioural components into education for sustainable development.
- 29. Digital competencies should be promoted as essential for social, economic, and political participation in an interconnected world. Access to digital technologies should help improve learning outcomes and promote collaboration and engagement among learners, creating a more dynamic learning environment. Media and information literacy is essential for developing critical thinking of learners and for combatting threats such as cyberbullying, hate speech, harassment, cyber fraud, misinformation and disinformation.
- 30. Climate change education, as part of education for sustainable development, should be integrated into curricula and across subjects to help understand and address the impacts of the climate crisis, to promote climate justice and to empower learners with the knowledge, skills, values and attitudes needed to act as agents of change. It should be learner-centred, experiential, contextualized, solutions-based and action-oriented. Education providers should adopt a whole-institution approach to climate action to lead by example.

Assessment and evaluation

31. Assessment, evaluation and evidence-based methods that support all learners and learning should be prioritized to strengthen collaboration, cooperation and mutual understanding and support learners' continuous and holistic development and their well-being. Education policy-

makers, education leaders, teachers and education personnel should endeavour to ensure that assessment and evaluation are free from cultural and any other bias and are solely designed to the benefit of learners and their learning process. As part of this, learners should be included in the assessment process which should contribute to learning by giving constructive feedback.

- 32. Special attention should be paid to a differentiated approach to assessment and evaluation which is context-specific and adaptive to all learners, including persons with disabilities, persons belonging to minorities, and those in vulnerable situations.
- 33. Member States should also pay attention to the particular requirements of the legal and ethical challenges of hybrid learning, including those which concern the protection of learners' and teachers' personal data, in terms of safeguarding equitable access and respect of the human rights and fundamental freedoms (e.g., privacy) of learners and teachers.
- 34. Performance assessment in all learning settings should be reliable, credible, transparent and trustworthy, adapted to the level of instruction, objective, context-specific and inclusive. It should cover cognitive, social and emotional, behavioural and psycho-motor competencies as well as systemic and interdisciplinary knowledge in alignment with this Recommendation. This includes the capacity to evaluate and apply knowledge in ways that promote the aims of this Recommendation.

Learning and teaching materials and resources

- 35. Member States should work towards ensuring that all teachers and learners have access to quality teaching and learning materials and resources, including multi-media content, which are infused with the guiding principles set forth in this Recommendation. Access to such materials, in physical and digital formats, could be facilitated by encouraging the sharing of open educational resources and by establishing physical and/or digital resource centres offering materials and guidance, including human resources or training, that support the aims of this Recommendation throughout education and lifelong learning.
- 36. Member States should work towards ensuring that these materials and resources encourage the development of multilingual skills, including Indigenous and mother tongue languages and are made available in compliance with applicable laws and, whenever possible, as open educational resources that apply the highest standards of privacy and data protection to facilitate the sharing of knowledge for the public common good.
- 37. Member States should invest in and facilitate the maintenance and renewal of devices and connectivity infrastructure as well as the production, adaptation, re-use, dissemination and sharing of up-to-date materials and high-quality digital resources to ensure that they are accessible for learners of all abilities and can support innovative approaches to education in all contexts and promote interactive, experiential and intergenerational learning. Member States should exploit new digital opportunities and rely on research evidence to mitigate against risks. Digital open-learning environments, digital resources and tools, and equipping learners with the necessary skills to use them will enable learners to engage responsibly with digital learning and reduce the digital divide.
- 38. All materials and resources should be relevant to learners' context and background, adapted to their educational level as well as to their developmental and learning needs. Teachers and learners should be involved in the development of materials to enhance their relevance. Materials and resources should be inclusive, incorporate gender equality, be free from stereotypes, all forms of discriminatory and hateful bias, and elements that incite discrimination, racism, xenophobia, hostility or violence towards any individuals, groups or peoples. Materials and resources should also actively aim to challenge and eradicate underlying prejudices and stereotypes and contribute to overcoming their consequences.

Learning environments

- 39. Learning environments, encompassing physical spaces, such as classrooms, workplaces, cultural and natural spaces, and virtual spaces, such as digital platforms or blended spaces that combine both physical and digital elements, contribute significantly to the quality of education and active citizenship, and should be created, maintained and renewed to reinforce the rights, protection, safety and well-being of all learners, teachers and education personnel.
- 40. Member States should support access to life-wide and lifelong learning starting in the early years in a diversity of educational settings and environments, including experiential learning and social internships, in order to expand access to and enrich the education experience and ensure that no one is left behind.
- 41. Member States are encouraged to take action to achieve this, including by:
 - (a) supporting all efforts to ensure learning environments and their facilities are inclusive, available, accessible, acceptable and adaptable as well as safe, secure and enabling for all learners without discrimination and, more broadly, aligned with the guiding principles of this Recommendation. In addition, educational environments should challenge all forms of biases, embrace anti-discrimination and anti-racist practices, and promote and respect cultural diversity;
 - (b) supporting the full, equal, equitable and meaningful participation of all children, young people and adults in teaching and learning programmes, educational administration and policy-making and decision-making activities. This includes promoting democratic learning environments that give voice to, and encourage contributions of parents and learners in the co-creation of safe spaces that model the principles of this Recommendation, giving special attention to those who have traditionally been excluded as members of vulnerable or disadvantaged groups including due to their gender, indigeneity, disability, minority status, refugee, migrant or displaced person status or as affected by occupation or crises;
 - (c) committing to provide infrastructural and technical support, adequate staffing, staff training and support, specialized services adapted to the needs of learners such as childcare services and youth organizations, financial support through scholarships, school meals, nutrition, mental health and other school health services, whenever possible;
 - (d) utilizing the potential of technology for inclusion by widening digital access to education and preventing digital divide through the development of safe and inclusive digital learning systems and environments. The development of digital tools should be accompanied by measures for the protection of personal and sensitive data, the protection of children and young people from online violence, such as cyberbullying and including gender-based violence, and by support for teachers and parents in order for them to be aware of the dangers which children face online and in order to help them support children in the full exercise of their rights;
 - (e) supporting and encouraging school leadership and management, teachers and education personnel to use natural and cultural sites and other public spaces as learning environments to take advantage of the benefits of learning outside of the traditional classroom and encourage commitment to social, cultural and environmental awareness and sustainability.

Development of teachers and education personnel

42. Teachers and education personnel play a key role in advancing the aims of the Recommendation as they carry out their educational responsibilities in formal and non-formal learning settings. Recognizing the direct influence of teacher motivation on the quality of education, Member States should strive to motivate the teaching personnel both extrinsically and intrinsically, to recognize their contribution, to hear their voice, and to improve their status

and working conditions, valuing their role in society, trusting, selecting, supporting, preparing and certifying them to support the aims of this Recommendation through actions such as:

- (a) Encouraging, providing and facilitating teacher and education personnel continuous professional development opportunities that support them in committing to and promoting human rights and the guiding principles set forth in this Recommendation and teach such principles in a way that they are understood and applied in practice by all learners;
- (b) Ensuring freedom of expression and opinion, as well as access to information, guaranteeing teachers', researchers' and education personnel's academic and intellectual freedom and respecting their autonomy and professionalism in teaching and research, especially for higher education institutions (HEI). To do so, appropriate institutional mechanisms, structures and governance should be put in place, as well as inclusive and equal opportunities for continuing professional development serving these purposes;
- (c) Supporting the ongoing development of teachers' and education personnel's interdisciplinary knowledge of world challenges and human rights, thereby enhancing their global awareness, as well as their abilities to foster the cognitive, social and emotional and behavioural competencies needed to achieve the aims of this Recommendation;
- (d) Providing opportunities for professional collaboration and peer-learning, the creation of networks, and international exchanges in pre- and in-service programmes;
- (e) Supporting opportunities for collaboration among all educational and other relevant stakeholders including teachers, education personnel, learners, education authorities, local communities where relevant, Indigenous People and their heritage-bearers, artists, cultural professionals, parents and caregivers, to co-design, implement and review education programmes, materials and resources, including through open educational resources, and tapping into the potential of already scaled and available technologies, enabling them to learn from each other, including in and through international forums and exchanges, and the creation of international networks;
- (f) Motivating educators to commit to the principles underpinning a culture of democracy, peace, human rights, sustainability and global citizenship as part of teaching standards and competency frameworks for teachers and students, guiding teacher professional development;
- (g) Encouraging and facilitating the national and international mobility of teachers, the exchange of national and regional experiences, as well as meetings for socialization and implementation of scientific results with diverse scopes;
- (h) Encouraging and facilitating opportunities for continuous professional development, including through offline, online, distance and hybrid modalities, to equip teachers with the skills outlined in this Recommendation. This should incorporate digital skills and other capacity building, as well as the promotion of opportunities for the development of research and projects as part of the continuing education of education professionals;
- (i) Providing continuous professional learning, updated information, resources, and advice to those entrusted with leadership, management, supervisory, mentoring or advisory responsibilities, enabling them to empower teachers and education personnel in achieving the aims of this Recommendation.
- 43. To foster inclusive, participatory, intercultural and innovative educational environments, Member States should enable public institutions, academic bodies, teachers' associations, unions and communities to dialogue, share best practices and strive to work together to

develop, in line with human rights and the guiding principles of this Recommendation, professional standards as defined by the profession itself to which all education professionals could adhere and which provide security and support for teachers', education personnel's and learners' well-being, especially those in emergency and crises-affected situations.

V.2. Specific requirements per level and type of education

44. To release the full and transformative potential of education, the guiding principles of this Recommendation should be embedded at all levels of education.

Early childhood care and education (ECCE)

- 45. Member States should consider early childhood care and education as a component of the right to education and children's rights. ECCE is a key stage in formal and non-formal educational planning and programming that should enhance the well-being, learning and development of young children. ECCE must promote equal opportunities for all (including children with specific educational needs) by meeting the children's need for care and play and giving them a strong foundation for development and lifelong learning and for fostering the knowledge, skills, and values needed to achieve the aims of this Recommendation.
- 46. This will require, among other things, investing in the high professionalization of ECCE personnel, which includes the provision of ongoing support through specific pre- and in-service training programmes and ensuring decent working conditions and careers.
- 47. Fundamental attitudes are often formed in the first years and foundational learning should therefore integrate global citizenship, peace and human rights. ECCE should be designed and organized as a social environment having its own character and value, in which various situations, including through play and story-telling, will enable children to become aware of their rights, to assert themselves freely while also learning about duties and responsibilities, and to improve and extend through direct experience their emotional and spiritual awareness and sense of belonging to increasingly larger communities, starting from family and school.
- 48. Parents, families and caregivers should be valued and supported, including through evidencebased and inclusive parenting support programmes and educational opportunities that help establish enabling environments in households and communities.

Primary and secondary education

- 49. Quality, inclusive, equitable, and relevant primary and secondary education are central to equip learners with the key knowledge, skills and values, to develop as individuals. Education should promote children's well-being, joy and health. This means that the relevance of learning and learner retention require as much attention as educational access in order to ensure that all learners complete schooling with the competencies required to lead active, healthy, sustainable and productive lives as autonomous and democratic adults.
- 50. All learners should be empowered through comprehensive sexuality education that is nondiscriminatory, evidence-based, scientifically accurate, relevant to cultural contexts, and ageappropriate. This focuses on building the knowledge of reproductive health and infection prevention, as well as the cognitive, social and emotional, and behavioural skills for healthy, respectful and equitable relationships.
- 51. Member States should make clear commitments to provide infrastructural and other forms of professional and technical support such as access to all-day schooling through synergies between the formal and non-formal education actors, guidance and counselling to help learners achieve learning outcomes and ensure continuity of learning in case of need, as well as bridging opportunities in circumstances of adversity or where other supports are needed so that learners are not excluded or left behind from educational opportunities and are given chances to keep advancing in their training.

Higher education and research

- 52. Higher education institutions (HEIs) and research are instrumental in the development and pursuit of knowledge, scientific advancement and the transfer of knowledge and as such contribute to the aims of this Recommendation.
- 53. Member States' legislative and policy settings should ensure conditions that enable HEIs and research institutions to provide lifelong and life-wide learning opportunities for all, that stimulate dialogue, democratic decision-making and partnerships among different sectors of society, and encourage the ethical, responsible and rights-observant use of scientific and technological knowledge and innovation.
- 54. Without impinging on the principles of academic freedom, and institutional autonomy, and while promoting academic integrity, HEIs and research institutions should help find innovative solutions to local and global challenges and bring about changes in individuals and systems that contribute to the aims of this Recommendation. This includes encouraging HEIs to ensure an inclusive learning environment, to help create and disseminate scientific, technological and innovative knowledge in education and in communities, and co-create inter- and transdisciplinary knowledge together with stakeholders and foster dialogue.
- 55. Member States and HEIs should foster quality assurance in education and research to ensure inclusive and equitable higher education design, operations, expectations and resource investments.
- 56. Member States and HEIs should implement procedures for the recognition of foreign qualifications inspired by the relevant UNESCO Conventions. Multilateral networks between HEIs should be strengthened by facilitating the physical and virtual mobility of students, researchers and educators, and by supporting student and faculty exchanges and programmes aimed at international cooperation in all forms, as well as facilitating the inclusion of refugees and displaced students, teaching and research staff.
- 57. Research, including in public-private, innovation-related partnerships, should be guided by ethical principles, including those of research integrity, and consider its impact on sustainability. Research funding mechanisms should be transparent and also follow ethical principles.
- 58. Open science policies and open educational resources are essential to foster equitable dissemination of knowledge and reflect the diversity of communities and practices that advance ethical, inclusive and equitable research.

Technical and vocational education and training (TVET)

- 59. Technical and vocational education and training (TVET) systems including all forms of professional education also within craft industries, should be inclusive, attractive and flexible in the way they adapt to the benefit of individuals, economies and societies in a future characterized by rapid change in line with this Recommendation. Improving TVET systems should promote social and inter-generational solidarity as well as equitable distribution of income and wealth. TVET systems should be labour market oriented and build on strong partnerships between public and private sectors, offering lifelong and life-wide learning opportunities for all. This is important to support societies that are increasingly challenged by multiple transitions, which have major implications for the distribution of income and wealth, solidarity between social groups and between generations.
- 60. TVET has an important role to play in promoting sustainable development by empowering individuals, organizations, enterprises and communities, and by developing skills for all individuals to learn, work and live for resilient, inclusive, equal, sustainable economies and peaceful societies. TVET's role is particularly important in supporting the environmental and energy transition, the circular economy and the digital transformation, as well as empowering

the individual in financial, legal and political affairs. TVET programmes should foster learners' knowledge, skills and attitudes as well as agency to actively participate in these and future social, economic and ecological transformations with a view to supporting the aims of this Recommendation.

61. The mutual recognition of TVET qualifications at national, regional and international levels, in relation to the mobility of learners and workers, should be promoted.

Adult learning and education

62. Adult learning and education (ALE) is a key component of lifelong and life-wide learning. It helps build learning societies and its policies and practices apply to a wide range of ages, developmental levels, education levels, learning spaces and modalities. Involving individuals, families, communities, organizations, workplaces, neighbourhoods, cities and regions, ALE should support the aims of this Recommendation by equipping people with the knowledge, attitudes, universal values, skills and behaviours to live together in peace as global citizens, to enjoy respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms and to lead decent lives in terms of health and well-being, culture, spirituality and economic and civic participation, environmental responsibility, sustainability and in all other ways that contribute to personal development and dignity.

Non-Formal Education and Informal Learning

63. Member States should promote and recognize non-formal education (NFE) that includes learning acquired in addition, alternative and/or as a complement to formal education and informal learning that occurs in daily life, in the family, in the workplace, in communities and through interests and activities of individuals. NFE and informal learning can play important roles in empowering children, young people and adults, including those that are outside of formal education settings so that they become agents of change at local, national, regional and global levels. Member States should value and invest in diverse non-formal and informal learning activities organized by, with and for adults, young people and children including out-of-school children. This can include supporting citizenship education, civil society organizations and youth organizations which strengthen resilience in the face of crisis and supporting non-formal means of expressing and transmitting culture through specific education.

VI. FOLLOW-UP AND REVIEW

- 64. The purpose of follow-up and review is to understand and document how Member States ensure the implementation of this Recommendation, to assess its implementation and outcomes, to provide suitable feedback mechanisms, to improve its implementation and to support the development of appropriate laws, policies and strategies, to identify and address challenges, to share examples of effective practices and to strengthen peer learning and cooperation.
- 65. Review and evaluation processes, at all levels, should be transparent, participatory, inclusive, meaningful, and ensure effective participation of all stakeholders to improve educational processes. They should encourage collaboration at the local, national, regional and international levels.
- 66. To achieve the aims outlined in this Recommendation, and in accordance with their specific contexts, governing structures and laws, Member States should credibly and transparently follow-up and review policies, laws, programmes and practices related to this Recommendation. To this end, Member States should:
 - (a) identify the institutions responsible for implementation, follow-up, review and evaluation of this Recommendation;

- (b) adopt a whole-of-society approach by using or establishing multi-stakeholder mechanisms;
- (c) in compliance with relevant legislations, norms and standards, and respecting data protection principles, collect, analyse, store, disseminate and promote the use of disaggregated and anonymized data in a timely, reliable, participatory, context-specific and valid manner, including by using existing data collection and reporting mechanisms, and by sharing effective and innovative practices; and
- (d) take appropriate measures to follow-up on the results of review processes.
- 67. To support Member States, UNESCO should:
 - (a) contribute to strengthening research- and evidence-based analysis of, and reporting on, laws and policies regarding this Recommendation;
 - (b) collect and disseminate progress, innovations, research reports, scientific publications as well as data and statistics regarding the provisions of this Recommendation in cooperation with relevant regional and global organizations, building on existing tools;
 - (c) support the development of appropriate, reliable, valid, comparable and cost-effective means and tools to enhance the capacities of national data systems;
 - (d) provide relevant stakeholders and focal points with targeted technical assistance, including training and capacity-building support, and encourage the creation of national networks of stakeholders and practitioners to contribute meaningfully and effectively to the follow-up and review processes.
- 68. Member States and UNESCO may consider creating observatories at the local, national, regional or global level, as appropriate, including repositories of materials, resources and data, concerning the implementation of this Recommendation, which all stakeholders can access and can contribute to. They may build upon existing experiences of relevant clearinghouses, to facilitate the exchange of ideas, creative applications and exemplary practices.
- 69. Other partners, practitioners and stakeholders should consider the following actions, taking into account their specific context, roles, responsibilities and capacities:
 - (a) Participating in follow-up and review processes as part of a multi-stakeholder community of practice, contributing to national reporting exercises and, where feasible, producing other relevant reports and accessible materials presenting various perspectives;
 - (b) Seeking training opportunities to develop capacities to participate effectively in follow-up and review processes and to promote the aims and guiding principles embedded in this Recommendation; and
 - (c) Building partnerships between different types of stakeholders to complement each other's expertise and experience and ensure that opinions from multiple perspectives regarding the follow-up and review of this Recommendation are taken into account.

VII. PROMOTION

- 70. Member States and all other stakeholders should respect, promote and protect the values, principles and standards related to this Recommendation and take all feasible steps to implement it.
- 71. Member States should strive to extend and complement their own actions in respect of this Recommendation by cooperating with each other through an intergovernmental approach and with all relevant stakeholders, both nationally and internationally, with the support of

UNESCO's relevant programmes and networks such as the UNESCO Chairs and UNITWIN Networks, and UNESCO Associated Schools Network (ASPnet), notably on the intertwining of education for sustainable development with education for global citizenship.

72. UNESCO should publicize and disseminate this Recommendation widely through all available means, including appropriate technologies, and share it with Member States, National Commissions for UNESCO, relevant international and regional partners, and human rights institutions for dissemination to all levels and actors of education.

Appendix

UNESCO standard-setting instruments

- Convention against Discrimination in Education (1960)
- Recommendation against Discrimination in Education (1960)
- Declaration of Principles of International Cultural Co-operation (1966)
- ILO/UNESCO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers (1966)
- Declaration on Race and Racial Prejudice (1978)
- Declaration and Integrated Framework of Action on Education for Peace, Human Rights and Democracy (1994)
- Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications concerning Higher Education in the European Region (1997)
- Declaration on the Responsibilities of the Present Generations Towards Future Generations (1997)
- Recommendation concerning the Status of Higher-Education Teaching Personnel (1997)
- UNESCO Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity (2001)
- Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage (2003)
- Recommendation concerning the Promotion and Use of Multilingualism and Universal Access to Cyberspace (2003)
- Convention on the Protection and promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions (2005)
- Asia-Pacific Regional Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications in Higher Education (2011)
- Revised Convention on the Recognition of Studies, Certificates, Diplomas, Degrees and Other Academic Qualifications in Higher Education in African States (2014)
- Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) (2015)
- Recommendation on Adult Learning and Education (2015)
- Recommendation concerning the Preservation of, and Access to, Documentary Heritage Including in Digital Form (2015)
- Recommendation on Science and Scientific Researchers (2017)
- Declaration of Ethical Principles in relation to Climate Change (2017)
- Recommendation on Open Educational Resources (OER) (2019)
- Global Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications concerning Higher Education (2019)
- Regional Convention on the Recognition of Studies, Diplomas and Degrees in Higher Education in Latin America and the Caribbean (2019)
- Recommendation on the Ethics of Artificial Intelligence (2021)
- Recommendation on Open Science (2021)
- Revised Convention on the Recognition of Studies, Diplomas and Degrees in Higher Education in the Arab States (2022)

Other international instruments

- Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948)
- Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and Sick in Armed Forces in the Field (First Geneva Convention) (1949)
- Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded, Sick, and Shipwrecked Members of the Armed Forces at Sea (Second Geneva Convention) (1949)
- Geneva Convention Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War (Third Geneva Convention) (1949)
- Geneva Convention Relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War (Fourth Geneva Convention) (1949)
- Convention on the Political Rights of Women (1953)
- Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict (1954)
- Declaration of the Rights of the Child (1959)
- Declaration on the Granting of Independence to Colonial Countries and Peoples (1960)
- International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (1966)
- International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (1966)
- International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural rights (1966)
- Declaration on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (1967)
- International Convention on the Suppression and Punishment of the Crime of Apartheid (1973)

- Declaration on the Protection of Women and Children in Emergency and Armed Conflict (1974)
- Protocol additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the protection of victims of international armed conflicts (Protocol I) (1977)
- Protocol additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the protection of victims of non-international armed conflicts (Protocol II) (1977)
- Convention on the Elimination of All forms of Discrimination Against Women (1979)
- Declaration on the Participation of Women in Promoting International Peace and Co- operation (1982)
- Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989)
- International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (1990)
- Convention on Biological Diversity (1992)
- Declaration on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National or Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities (1992)
- United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (1992)
- Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against Women (1993)
- Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action (1993)
- The Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action (1995)
- Declaration and Programme of Action on a Culture of Peace (1999)
- United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325 (2000)
- Durban Declaration and Programme of Action Following the World Conference Against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance (2001)
- Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (2006)
- Fribourg Declaration on Cultural Rights (2007)
- UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (2007)
- United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training (2011)
- Paris Agreement (2015)
- United Nations Security Council Resolution 2250 (2015)
- United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Peasants and Other People Working in Rural Areas (2018)
- Youth 2030: The UN Youth Strategy (2018)
- Lisboa+21 Declaration on Youth Policies and Programmes (2019)
- United Nations Policies and programmes involving youth Resolution (2021)
- United Nations Security Council Resolution 2601 (2021)
- United Nations General Assembly Resolution 76/300 on the human right to a clean, healthy and sustainable environment (2022)

Intergovernmental initiatives

- Plan of Action for the United Nations Decade for Human Rights Education (1995)
- Declaration of Principles and Action Plan "Building an Information Society: a global challenge in the new Millennium" (2003)
- UNESCO/OECD Guidelines in "Quality Provision of Cross-Border Higher Education" (2005)
- Plan of Action for the World Programme for Human Rights Education (2006)
- Inclusive education: the way of the future; conclusions and recommendations of the 48th session of the International Conference on Education (2008)
- United Nations World Programme of Action for Youth (2010)
- Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development (2015)
- Incheon Declaration and Framework for Action 'Towards inclusive and equitable quality education and lifelong learning for all' (2015)
- The Safe Schools Declaration (2015)
- The Kazan Action Plan "A Foundation of the Global Framework for Leveraging Sport for Development and Peace", MINEPS VI (2017)
- Framework for the implementation of Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) beyond 2019 (2019)
- Berlin Declaration on Education for Sustainable Development (2021)
- Paris Declaration: A Global Call for Investing in the Futures of Education (2021)
- Rewired Global Declaration on Connectivity for Education (2021)

- Marrakech Framework for Action "Harnessing the transformational power of Adult Learning and Education" (2022)
- Youth Declaration on Transforming Education (2022)
- UNESCO Strategy for Technical and Vocational Education and Training 2022-2029 (2022)
- Tashkent Declaration and Commitments to Action for Transforming Early Childhood Care and Education (2022)

ED/REV-1974REC/2023/INF.08



unesco

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

Organisation des Nations Unies pour l'éducation, la science et la culture

Organización de las Naciones Unidas para la Educación, la Ciencia y la Cultura

Организация Объединенных Наций по вопросам образования, науки и культуры

联合国教育、 科学及文化组织

منظمة الأمم المتحدة للتربية والعلم والثقافة

INTERGOVERNMENTAL SPECIAL COMMITTEE MEETINGS (CATEGORY II) FOR THE REVISION OF THE 1974 RECOMMENDATION CONCERNING EDUCATION FOR INTERNATIONAL UNDERSTANDING, CO-OPERATION AND PEACE AND EDUCATION RELATING TO HUMAN RIGHTS AND FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOMS

30 May - 2 June and 10-12 July 2023

Room II, UNESCO Headquarters

Paris, France

FINAL ORAL REPORT OF THE RAPPORTEUR

12 July 2023

Distinguished Member States, Dear Ambassadors, Permanent Delegates, experts and observers, it is a great privilege and honour for me to present to you my Oral Report of your deliberations during the inter-governmental Special Committee meetings for the revision of the 1974 Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms.

Let me at the outset Chairperson extend to you our profound appreciation and thank you for your leadership and for guiding us through a very challenging process.

I would like to thank Ms Stefania Giannini, Assistant Director-General for Education and her wonderful team for their remarkable dedication and professionalism.

My appreciation also goes to my colleagues in the Bureau from Canada, Chile, Oman and the Republic of Moldova for their tireless efforts in ensuring we have reached consensus on a revised text to be submitted to the 42nd session of the UNESCO General Conference for adoption.

Representatives from 112 Member States - 102 in the first and 89 in the second session, one non-Member State and 50 Observers – 45 in the first and 9 in the second - took part in the meetings.

The UNESCO Assistant Director-General for Education, Ms Stefania Giannini, opened the first meeting on Tuesday 30 May 2023 with an introductory speech highlighting the bold and visionary nature of the original 1974 Recommendation and how it embodied the spirit and mandate of the Organization "to build the defences of peace in the minds of men and women" through education. After nearly 50 years, it was time to update it to ensure the technical guidance it contains is relevant to contemporary and future threats to peace, fundamental freedoms and international understanding. In November 2021, UNESCO Member States requested a revision of the Recommendation to better align it with the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and legal norms adopted since 1974 and to reflect developments in education since then including UNESCO's Futures of Education Report and the UN Secretary-General's Transforming Education Summit in September 2022.

In recognizing the active participation of all Member States in the revision process, Ms Giannini expressed thanks to the governments of Japan, the Republic of Korea, Saudi Arabia and Sweden and to the YOU Foundation for their generous contributions to the consultations and to the Special Committee meetings.

His Excellency, Ambassador Richard Bosire, the Permanent Delegate of Kenya, was elected as the Chairperson of the Meeting and Mr Kazi Ehsanul Haque, Deputy Permanent Delegate of Bangladesh was nominated as Rapporteur. The Vice-Chairpersons were from Canada, Chile, Oman and the Republic of Moldova.

Mr Christopher Castle, the Director of the Division for Peace and Sustainable Development, presented the revision process to date and how the extensive series of technical, thematic and formal consultations resulted in the development of the first and second revised draft texts. Mr Castle also presented the new structure of the Recommendation and the draft proposed title.

Following the presentation, 20 Member States spoke to welcome the draft text and largely agreed that a revision was justified in order to include and recognize newer concepts in education in a rapidly digitizing world. Member States thanked the Secretariat for organizing an open, transparent and participatory consultative process and to commend the many experts and partners including Member States who had contributed to the revision process, whose intergovernmental nature can also revitalize commitment to multilateral and multistakeholder cooperation. It was acknowledged that the revision process had resulted in a proposal that was well-founded and a solid basis for the negotiations to take place. The importance of the Recommendation in guiding education policies was reiterated and Member States expressed hope that the revised instrument will continue to provide guidance in addressing global challenges in implementing quality education.

During the course of the meeting, observers were also given an opportunity to make short interventions. Eight observers spoke to commend the transparency of the consultation process and efforts to include contemporary challenges in the revised text.

Following the Secretariat's response to the Member State interventions, the Chair opened the negotiations. He explained the working procedures of the meeting in order to ensure that the Committee's work would be completed by the end of the meeting. It was agreed that amendments would be considered according to the following criteria:

- The focus should be on the main objective and aim of the Recommendation. Changes should enrich not dilute the text;
- Repetitions and duplications should be minimized;
- Changes should, as a far as possible, speak to the largest number of Member States and promote what "unites rather than divides";
- To the extent possible, adopted or standard language should be preferred.

It was agreed that, once Member States had reached consensus on a given paragraph, debate should not be reopened. Where necessary, Member States expressed their reservations which are recorded in this Oral Report.

During the first Special Committee meeting agreement was reached on the Definitions, Aims, Scope, Guiding Principles and much of the Action Areas. We also reached consensus on the following new title: *Recommendation on Education for Peace and Human Rights, International Understanding, Cooperation, Fundamental Freedoms, Global Citizenship and Sustainable Development.*

Between the first and second sessions, Member States met informally to discuss and reformulate text for the more complex paragraphs which formed the basis for discussions during the second session.

During the second session, an open-ended Working Group, chaired by H.E. Ambassador Adam AI Mulla of Kuwait, was formed to review the preambular paragraphs before discussion in the plenary.

Ambassador Al Mulla presented a short report on the Working Group, expressed his gratitude to all Member States who participated in the constructive discussions and thanked the Secretariat for its support.

The Chair brought out consensus among all Member States by carefully listening to their opinions and suggestions and enabling a fruitful dialogue. There were several proposals to add new paragraphs in different sections resulting in the addition of seven new paragraphs (from 65 paragraphs in the second draft to 77 in the agreed text).

Every paragraph discussed was agreed by consensus which demonstrates the flexibility and constructiveness of all Member States here present. Nevertheless, a number of reservations were raised. Please note that paragraph numbers are those that appear in the final agreed text and may differ from the numbers quoted in plenary when we were reviewing the text.

- Concerning the new title, the Russian Federation and Saudi Arabia expressed reservations on the inclusion of 'global citizenship' because it is a relatively new concept and not fully defined as agreed text. In addition, the Russian Federation expressed concerns that the words "peace", "international understanding" and "fundamental freedoms" are now separated. Canada asked to record that it does not support the use of a truncated version of the title for promotional purposes.
- Regarding the text as a whole, the Islamic Republic of Iran asked for the following reservation to be recorded: respecting all the efforts made for the revision of the 1974 Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Cooperation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, and its superseding Recommendation and Guidance, the Islamic Republic of Iran considers this recommendation as a non-legally binding and voluntary instrument. The Islamic Republic of Iran is not committed to those parts of this Revised Recommendation that might in one way or another be interpreted as contradictory to the national legislations and priorities, religious beliefs, and cultural values of the Iranian society. Moreover, in the event of a contradiction between the provisions of national law and the above-mentioned instruments, national law and legislation shall prevail.
- Regarding the third preambular paragraph, the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland (hereinafter referred to as "the United Kingdom") expressed its concern that not all of the instruments referenced create or reflect binding international human rights obligations. In particular, in the United Kingdom's view, the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (which is also referenced in the Appendix) refers to rights bestowed at the national level by governments to Indigenous Peoples.
- Pakistan proposed adding the words "with responsibility" after "freedom of expression and opinion" in preambular paragraph 14. Algeria proposed adding the words "in respect for others" to that phrase. In order to reach consensus, Pakistan agreed to withdraw its proposal but asked for its reservation to be recorded in this report. Algeria did not withdraw its proposal.
- When discussing preambular paragraph 14, Sweden proposed a slight modification (i.e., "ensuring that human rights and fundamental freedoms are upheld" rather than "achieving ... human rights and fundamental freedoms") that reached consensus in the room. However, in order to reach consensus for the paragraph as a whole, Sweden was willing to compromise by suggesting going back to the original text (i.e., "promoting ... human rights and fundamental freedoms") that was presented for the Working Group. That text was never presented to the room. Sweden therefore asked that the Oral Report record that its proposed amendment reached consensus and that its compromise wasn't sufficiently acknowledged.
- Following adoption of preambular paragraph 16, Finland expressed its disappointment with the procedure for adoption of the paragraph and asked to add the word "peace" before "international understanding" which it felt had been omitted in error. Since the change could not be made it asked for this to be recorded in this report.

- In relation to the Appendix referenced in preambular paragraph 22, the United Kingdom expressed concerns about the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action, due to historic issues with antisemitism at the Durban Conference.
- India proposed to add two paragraphs to the preamble to emphasize that building emotional and spiritual quotient in learners can not only have a lasting impact on the culture of peace and human rights, including respect for the individual, nature, planet, and sustainability and thus plays an important role in realizing the principles of this Recommendation. Additionally, it also emphasized that recognition and active development of TVET systems is important and beneficial, in particular for displaced populations, including migrants and refugees for their skilling, reskilling, and upskilling. Since these paragraphs were not adopted, it asked for the report to make note of its position.
- Legal implications of paragraph 3 of the draft resolution generated considerable discussion among Member States some of whom proposed alternative formulations related to "compliance with national legislations and ratified Conventions". However, the original text, which was consistent with previous UNESCO Recommendations, was adopted. Saudi Arabia's reservations are therefore recorded in this report.
- With regard to the definition of "education" (paragraph 1a): the Russian Federation felt that it had not been given the floor when requested and was not able to have its proposal for the use of adopted language considered. It asked that this report acknowledges its reservations and its preference to include in the definition the phrase: "the full development of the human personality and the sense of its dignity" from Article 13 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.
- The Russian Federation proposed that while the term "transformative education" (paragraph 1(h)) could be used in the text it was premature to include a formal definition as the concept was very new and still evolving. Nevertheless, the consensus reached was that a definition would be useful. The Russian Federation therefore asked for its concern to be recognized in this report.
- It was agreed to use the definition of the concept of "respect for diversity" (paragraph 6(c)) from the Recommendation on the Ethics of Artificial Intelligence adopted by the 41st session of the UNESCO General Conference. India proposed to add the word "culture" to that definition, but this was not accepted by other Member States. It therefore asked for its concern regarding the omission to be noted.
- During negotiations on the paragraph concerning "peaceful conflict resolution and transformation skills" (paragraph 6(k)), to which a number of amendments were proposed, Egypt and Oman preferred to retain the original text and asked that their reservations be reflected in this report. India asked to reflect its concern that the word "negotiated" was retained which it felt was adequately covered by the term "mediation".
- The United Kingdom wished to have noted their preference to delete the "right to development" in paragraph 8 (b) citing that while it is clear that the right to development is an obligation of States to ensure individuals are able to enjoy their human rights and have equal opportunity to fulfil their potential, these obligations are already enshrined and clearly set out in the existing human rights treaties. Implementing these existing obligations is the only way to realise the right to development.
- During the discussion on paragraph 8(c), Argentina and Spain spoke of the importance of recognizing discrimination on the grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity. When this proposed amendment was not accepted, they asked that a reference should be made elsewhere in the Recommendation.
- Morocco expressed disappointment that its proposed amendments had not been considered sufficiently in a number of instances and asked for this to be recorded in this report.

- Following discussions on paragraph 12, Saudi Arabia asked for its concern that a reference to "in conformity with their legal systems" or "according to national legislations" had not been retained to be recorded in this report.
- During discussions on paragraph 18, Cuba expressed its disappointment that its proposal to include a reference to "adolescents" in relation to physical and mental development was not agreed, with the language of "children and young people" being agreed by the room instead.
- Following agreement on paragraph 21, China, Oman, Saudi Arabia and Zambia expressed their reservations and preferred the original draft of this paragraph without amendments.
- During discussions on paragraph 27, Hungary expressed its reservation that the phrase "mother tongue language of instruction" was not accepted with the room preferring "mother tongue languages" only.
- Poland, supported by Algeria, asked to replace "gender equality" in paragraph 28 by "men and women equality". When this was not agreed it expressed its reservations. Poland expressed the same concern in relation to paragraph 38.
- The Russian Federation asked for its reservation on the rejection of its proposed quote from Target 4.5 of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development in paragraph 32 to be recorded.
- Lithuania expressed its concern that decent pay and adequate workload were not mentioned as factors that motivate teaching personnel in paragraph 42 and made a proposal on how to include them but it was not reflected.
- Poland expressed its concern that the term "transformative" was not deleted as it had requested in paragraph 44.
- Saudi Arabia requested that its reservation on the use of the term "comprehensive sexuality education" in paragraph 50 be noted in this report as well as its concern that its proposed reference to "in compliance with national legislation and ratified Conventions" was not included. It asked that the same concern be expressed in relation to paragraph 66.
- Poland expressed its reservation on the use of the term "comprehensive sexuality education" in paragraph 50 as it understands that education on sexuality is part of health education.
- During discussions of paragraph 54, Zambia asked that the scope of the paragraph should be extended beyond Higher Education Institutions to also cover researchers in all settings – not just in Higher Education Institutions or research institutions. Zambia therefore asked to have its concern recorded when the decision was taken to limit the scope to Higher Education Institutions and research institutions.
- Upon adoption of paragraph 65, Finland expressed its disappointment with the procedure for adoption of the paragraph and asked for its preference for the original text to be recorded in this report.
- Following discussion of paragraph 71 and the decision in this paragraph and earlier paragraphs not to include a detailed list of "relevant stakeholders", Finland asked that such a list should be included in this report. References in the Recommendation to "relevant stakeholders" should therefore be understood to include some or all of the following depending on the specific context of the reference: *national and local governments, municipalities, independent human rights institutions, civil society and non-governmental organizations, teachers, education personnel, parents, learners, education unions, researchers and academia, the private sector and other relevant stakeholders.*
- There were several proposed amendments to the Appendix, and it was agreed to adopt the section with time afforded to review the exact titles of the international instruments and the

date of their adoption. The subsection on intergovernmental initiatives generated some debate among Member States regarding the status of some of the documents proposed. In the end, it was decided to remove documents that had not been negotiated between Member States. This included a number of guidelines concerning comprehensive sexuality education, disability-inclusive communication (proposed by Lithuania) and LGBTI rights (proposed by Canada). Canada and Lithuania had suggested retaining them for their utilitarian value and expressed their reservations when this was not the case. Argentina, Belgium, the Netherlands, Spain and Sweden also expressed their support for retaining these documents.

Throughout the two meetings, there was an in-depth discussion on the content of the Recommendation. Several pertinent issues were raised and resulted in extended discussions. I have noted a few to share with you:

- Reinforcing Member States' commitment to internationally agreed upon foundational texts;
- Empowering learners with knowledge, skills, values and behaviours that enable them to thrive in a complex world;
- Providing the appropriate training and professional development to teachers and education personnel to enable them to realize the aims of this Recommendation;
- The importance of digital skills, media and information literacy, and data protection in the face of digitization;
- The recognition of TVET qualifications for empowering such personnel, including displaced persons;
- The importance of academic integrity, academic freedom, and institutional autonomy;
- The need to adopt a whole institution and whole-of-society approach in legislation and policy development.

The Secretariat has assured that, as is standard for such instruments, the text will be reviewed by a Reading Committee after its adoption by the General Conference. This will ensure that all language versions are well aligned, that references, titles and dates of documents are accurate, and the Appendix contains only references to instruments that have been negotiated between Member States and have a global coverage.

I would like to congratulate all Member States on reaching consensus on the final text in a constructive, forward-looking and practical manner. A special thank you goes to those representatives who met between the two sessions of the Special Committee to reach agreement on the more contentious paragraphs and to propose reformulated text during the second session that served as a basis for eventual acceptance by all. We now have a well-crafted proposal for the 42nd General Conference which, if adopted, should ensure the promotion through education of peace, human rights, international understanding, cooperation, fundamental freedoms, global citizenship and sustainable development for the next half century.

Colleagues, Chair,

As this is the last time I address you as the Rapporteur for the Special Committee on the elaboration of this revised Recommendation, I would like to thank you all for your patience, commitment, and kindness. It has been an honour and a privilege to serve as your Rapporteur.

Dear Member States,

You have contributed to making history today. I send you my congratulations for your exemplary work.

Thank you.